

Boulevard Planning Group
Minutes/Summary, February 3, 2011
Boulevard Fire and Rescue Inc. Training Room, 39919 Highway 94/Ribbonwood

1. **Call to Order:** 7:08 PM
2. **Determination of Quorum/Roll Call:** Members Present: Tammy Daubach, Cheryl Lenz, Jeffrey McKernan, Chris Noland, Patricia Stuart, Donna Tisdale(Chair) and Audra Hall.
3. **Approval of Minutes:** Motion/Second: Jeff McKernan/Chris Nolan to approve the January 6, 2011 meeting minutes. Passed 6-0-1 (Audra Hall abstained due to absence at January meeting).
4. **Correspondence:**
 - A. **San Diego Astronomy Association** Boulevard has a 1 million dollar observatory on Tierra Del Sol Road that requires dark skies. They have asked the community to purchase / use only shielded lights that Home Depot is offering for a reduced price (\$10.00?). These shielded lights do not interfere with the dark skies. Flyers were provided.
 - B. **Boulevard Bike Race UCSD Cycling Team.** Cycles will go through Live Oak Springs, Boulevard and Campo. Race will begin Saturday Feb. 5th but they will set up on Friday Feb. 4th. The course will be cleared by the end of the day Sat. Feb. 5th. Roads include Old Highway, LA Posta Road, Highway 94 and Tierra Del Sol Road. The Cycle teams contact information was provided.
5. **Invenergy** – A note from Bo Alley was read into the record. He received late notice of the meeting and could not attend. The Planning Group Meeting Agenda was sent in a timely manner to previous Invenergy contact, Brit Coupens. The Chair later learned from Coupens that he had been laid off and Invenergy had closed their S.D. office. The Chair finally made contact with the Campo tribal chair, just days before our meeting, who provided contact information for the new contact, Bo Alley.
6. **New Business:**
 - A. **PUC(Public Utilities Commission)/BLM(Bureau of Land Management) DEIR/EIS for Tule Wind, ECO Substation, Energia Sierra Juarez & Cumulative Impact Projects. Estimated 392 Industrial Wind Turbines. Comments Due February 16, 2011:** The Planning Group invited the project developers to come and make presentations (Invenergy was unable to attend). Cameron Durckel on behalf of SDG&E & representing the ECO Substation was present. Mr. Durckel made several comments; The 4 components of the project, New Substation called the ECO Substation located in Jacumba, the rebuild and expansion of the substation in Boulevard, a 138 kV transmission line would connect the two and a loop. There would be a hub connection of renewable energy. They are aggressively pursuing renewable energy. The benefits locally are improving reliability in the back country, economic stimulus and jobs created. There would be 89 jobs created at peak construction the positions would be regional (fencing labor jobs etc.) A \$36 million dollar impact was claimed. Union issues (PLA for Sunrise –Project Labor Agreement) ECO project has yet to be determined if it will have a PLA. They will spend dollars on local services; fencing, concrete, food etc. locally. Donna stated that she has had several calls from people saying they are union members and they have been turned away from job site and told to go to their union hall, then the hall tells them they do not do site specific hiring. An audience member stated that union laws have changed and they have to go to the hall and not job sites specifically. Mr. Durckel

commented that there are two batching plants in Jacumba that they may be using and he was very proud of their stimulus to our community. A board member asked if they have received stimulus money or government money for these projects and Mr. Durckel replied, "No". The project will be paid for by rate recovery. San Diego County picks up 10% of infrastructure projects and the rest will be spread throughout the state. SDG&E is working with Manzanita and Campo tribes to develop wind projects. The ECO substation will allow the renewal energy projects to come to the grid. The cost is approximately \$285 million for the proposed project and maybe more with the possible undergrounding of 4 miles between the Boulevard Substation to the Southwest Powerlink easement to the south. Donna asked how many properties were subject to eminent domain. He did not know the answer but said it depended on the final EIR/EIS and that BLM could make changes. They go 20ft. down to underground approximately, like Alpine Blvd. He said it was feasible but would not comment on the property purchase or easement.

Questions Mr. Durckel (SDG&E) was asked to answer:

1. Since Mr. Durckel reported this evening that "negotiations are continuing", it was asked: It has been reported in the media that those negotiations had been abandoned. So who is involved in these "negotiations" you mention for the shut off of power in the back country? What are the results of those negotiations? Supervisor Jacob involved with this process? (Cheryl)
2. Mr. Durckel was asked to take an inventory over a period of 2 months on the dollars/jobs that impact our community locally and to report back to the board on his findings.(community member)
3. How many jobs out of the 89 would be manual labor? How would you try to hire local people? (Patricia)
4. Mr. Durckel will get back to the board on the batching plants that they will be using in Jacumba.(community member)
5. Mr. Durckel will double check on the land use (condemnation of properties).
6. Who owns the property that SDG&E is going to underground and who lobbied for it? (asked by a community member)
7. Would it be an easement through "X" property that is going to be undergrounding or would you buy the whole property? (Cheryl)
8. What was the cause of the fire at SDG&E's Escondido Substation? (Donna)
9. What are the expansion plans for the ECO /Boulevard substations and additional lines? (Donna)
10. How wide are the easements that you are purchasing or condemning now and how many lines would they accommodate? (Donna) What are the properties you are condemning?
11. Are they going to clear grade, or take vegetation down to the ground, what they call fuel management, across the width of the easement between Boulevard and Jacumba? Is SDG&E going to use a brush hog like they on the south end of the Campo reservation, is this the plan? (Donna)
12. Would our oaks be cut like in Alpine?
13. Please let us know what the official route is going to be?

14. Do we have someone else that we can contact about SDG&E's proposed Campo wind project? Why is SDG&E marking and surveying private property due west of the Golden Acorn Casino off of Old Highway 80? (Donna)
15. Have easements and road access been secured across tribal lands for the Campo/Manzanita project? Substations will be off tribal lands on private lands can you comment on where that will be? (Donna)
16. How many wood to steel poles have been and will be replaced, by SDG&E, and what is the route? Will they allow higher voltage transmission, what is the capacity of the poles? Where is the paperwork for what has already been done in Boulevard? (Golden Acorn to Old 80, Jewel Valley to Rough Acres) What does replace-as-needed mean?
17. What material are you going to use for shielding the substation? (Cheryl)
18. There are some people who are experiencing an excess of stray electricity voltage coming from wind turbines and substations. Would SDG&E be willing pay for an unbiased 3rd party to do a pre-construction stray voltage survey? (Donna) (He said to ask for it in the letter)
19. What is the expected timeline for the Manzanita wind project and how far along are you with that project, an MOU with the tribe? (Mr. Durckel stated that they are just beginning and no wind energy companies are involved yet)
20. Donna stated that the MET towers are close to some homes and asked if SDG&E has a setback policy on wind turbines? *(They would not be the developer and would go through the same process as any other turbine project)* Who determined where the MET towers were placed? Who did the testing and who installed them? (He had no answers).
21. When is the next SDG&E community meeting? (Cheryl)
22. Where are the answers you promised on Sunrise Powerlink tree trimming / removal issue along Cameron Truck Trail?(Donna)
23. Can you give the board/community a list of questions that you have been asked and will answer?(community member) (Chris Wahl , Southwest Strategies, stated he was taking notes for SDG&E)

Sempra Energy was not present to discuss their Energia Sierra Juarez project as they had informed the Chair that they would be.

Iberdrola Renewables / Tule Wind

The next guest speaker was Harley McDonald a business developer with Iberdrola working on the Tule Wind Project. This is a 200 megawatt wind farm that Iberdrola wants permitted for 65 – 128 wind turbines 3 miles north of 8 along McCain Valley Road follows that all the way up onto tribal land Ewiiwaapaayp. The project is located on BLM land, private land, state land and tribal land. The transmission line will come down McCain Valley road crossing 8 turning on Old Highway 80 to the substation. Maximum capacity it would power 60 thousand homes with clean renewable energy. They have been studying site for 5 years, 2 years of environmental study. All studies are summarized in the environmental document. She mentioned a study about property values that was done by the Department of Energy in

conjunction with SDSU they looked at 7,000 homes that were near 27 different wind farms in the US that found property values did not change significantly due to the wind farms (2009) Donna stated that this study had been discredited. Community members asked for property value guarantee agreements. Harley stated that that would not be something they would do. She said that she would read the document that discredited their study and that we can send it to her. Donna stated that we can request that they give property value guarantee agreements from the Department of the Interior like the Campo Landfill project. Jeffrey Derosher, the permitting manager and technical expert on the environmental studies, was introduced. Derosher and Durckel said Iberdrola has a guaranteed gen-tie agreement for 200 MW. Mr. Durckel was asked what the capacity of the Southwest Powerlink was and he stated that it is 1,000 MW. Noise issues were raised by the board. Our ambient noise level is 20-25 decibels and we are being told that the turbines are at 45 decibels, far above the natural ambient noise level, and not counting low frequency noise levels. Iberdrola has received over \$ 1 billion subsidies. Harley stated that they have spent 100% of those monies in the US market only that none of it went overseas. The parent company is in Spain but they are a U.S. corporation and the headquarters are in Portland. They are trying to build up the U.S. market and any monies they get here are not shared back in Spain but spent to open and build the U.S. market for wind farms. Donna stated that these questions need to be addressed in writing so that the agencies are aware that we want responses to them. A comment was made by a community tribal member (Angela) regarding Golden Eagles known to be in the area with fledglings hatched in 2010. They are supposed to be protected by our government. She stated that her great grandfather, Jim McCarty (?), knew of Golden Eagle nests on the east of the Ewiiapaayp Reservation, saying "He was a medicine man of my people and documented that nesting site 80-90 years ago and wrote about it in a book. I will get the copy of it and that nest and area of eagles were used in ceremonies of our people. The eagle is the most important animal in our religion and culture, it is part of our clan's creation story". McDonald said their turbines can safely operate in 60-70 mile wind range. They go the same speed 14-15 times per minute despite the wind speed. Mrs. McDonald stated that they are committed to putting fire suppression systems in each turbine, Fire trace makes the system. Saying, "We have also agreed to install 5-10,000 gallon water tanks that will be placed at the discretion of the fire groups". Donna raised concerns with that and about the abundance and significance of the cultural sites in the McCain valley. Harley admitted that there are a lot of cultural sites out there, saying "Our original project was 500 Mega Watts and we have reduced to 200 MW to reduce the environmental impacts to this area. We are also moving turbines and roads to avoid everything that we could. There will be a new map available in the final document". Comments were made by the community about the effect the turbines would have on our public health and safety, habitats and wildlife, bighorn sheep, camping, tourists, dark skies, groundwater and wells, roads, peace and quiet, property values and industrializing our whole area. They mentioned the upkeep on the existing 25 Kumeyaay Wind turbines, cranes and blade damages that we have witnessed. Donna made a statement to the community that when we file our comments that we should ask for a minimum 30-45 day comment extension and ask for a public participation hearing. Harley thanked the

community for inviting them out and gave her business card to the group for anyone's follow up questions. List of questions:

The Tule Wind / Iberdrola Questions that Mrs. McDonald was asked:

1. Does Iberdrola have a Power Purchase Agreement (PPA) with SDG&E yet? *She stated no, these things take time.* Donna mentioned the new SDG&E PPA with Ocotillo Express Wind the is a much newer project with scoping closed in mid-January.(No comment from Iberdrola or SDG&E on that new PPA)
2. Is there enough room on the Southwest Powerlink to run all the electricity that this project is going to generate (200MW)? *She stated that they were grandfathered in and have had the Queue position on the powerlink for years. We have a guaranteed 200MW on that line.* Donna stated that the Dept. of Energy and Sempra had both stated publicly that there was only 80MW of capacity left on the line. Again McDonald said that they have guaranteed space.
3. What is the Queue position number with Cal ISO and what is the link to find that number?
4. Is there a set easement along the McCain Valley east or west? *Yes, there are set backs to County roads, BLM roads, property lines, homes and any building whether occupied or not.*
5. What is the closest? *The closest residence or occupied building is 1,000 feet. There are different calculations depending on the size of the turbine they do 131% of the total height from the base to the blade at the 12 o'clock position. For homes there are also multiple setbacks. There are noise setbacks, height set back and they take the greater of the two and it is in the EIR chapter on health and safety D-10.*
6. What type, make and model of wind turbine are you using? *Not yet determined.*
7. How do you rate the noise of the turbine, is that A rated? *Yes, it is rated on the A scale.*
8. Are there any problems associated with the noise? *There are no documented health conditions related to noise.* Can we have a guarantee that we will not have health issues? (Tammy) *No guarantee.*
9. Can you prove that none of the government subsidies have gone overseas but have all been spent in the U.S. market? (Patricia) *We can get that to you.*
10. Do you have contracted easements between McCain Valley and the Boulevard Substation? (Donna) *No not yet.*
11. Tammy brought up that their document states that the wind farms can interfere with radio, T.V. and other frequencies? (Tammy) *It can but that involves some technical analysis that is beyond us but generally there is not an impact but it can become fuzzy and we are required to install a repeater or something that will improve that signal back to the way it was.*
12. Does it mess with Satellites? (Tammy) *It should not mess up satellites because of the height of the signal coming down. We are required to fix any problem that occurs due to our equipment.*
13. Do you currently have any litigation against any of your projects? (Donna) *I'm not aware of any. It may have happened in the past but I do not know. Donna, Please check and get back with us.*
14. Do you have any outstanding road maintenance issue with the county? *It is very common to have a road agreement with the county and when you do construction. We have to survey before and after and make sure the roads are the way they were or better.*

15. Do you have signed agreements or easements with Campo or Manzanita for the use of their roads and all 36 miles? (Donna) *No. We need agreements with Campo and Manzanita to use their roads.*
16. Are you going to take out any oak trees along those roads? There is no way you can maneuver those large trucks and equipment on those narrow wind roads with over-hanging oaks. (Donna) *I don't think we will need to remove any oaks.*
17. How do these things impact the sensor traffic and the radio traffic that is required by the U.S. Border Patrol? (Bob, community member) *I don't believe that it would have an impact because of the repeaters that they use and microwave lengths that have a direct line of sight.*
18. How will these impact flights and the B.P. helicopters? *I don't believe there would be any interference.*
19. A question about the preferred alternative that removes some of the turbines. *How are you going to address the removal of these turbines? The full build out of the project is what we prefer over the alternate.*
20. Do you have an agreement with the Ewiiwaapaayp tribe? (Jeff) *Yes. Are they able to sue you if there is a reduction of turbines as proposed? That is a confidential document between us and them but no we are not required to compensate them for any losses.*
21. Talk to us about the eagle study, are there eagles nesting on the reservation where your turbines are going? (tribal member) *There were 2 years of avian studies done observing all species (EIR) two Golden Eagles were cited and a third was observed as the surveyor was leaving. Are there nests? Yes, there are nests in the region and in the vicinity. Have they produced fledglings? Yes. What is the impact to the eagles? We don't believe there will be an impact. How close are the turbines going to be to the nests? Eagle's nests change every year and they are within 100 feet.*
22. How is the company going to guarantee that the wind turbines will not drive away the Golden Eagles? *Please submit that to the CPUC with your other comments.*
23. What is in your avian protection plan? *Our proposal is that we would not build them on the ridge if there is a demonstration that the eagles are using the ridge.*
24. Would Iberdrola be willing to fund an unbiased 3rd party to do ambient noise level, infrasound, stray electricity levels for people within a mile of your turbines?(Donna) *We will look in to that sure. (2-5 miles would be great)(Donna)*
25. Does the noise from the turbines interfere with our bats sonar or a threat to the bat population? (community member) *They don't appear to be affected by the noise or sonar. There is a bat study within the EIR. The studies were done at caves mines and at two of our met towers. (Donna stated that when bats get too close to turbines, the change in air pressure can explode their lungs)*
26. Infrared lights were proposed for the Sunrise Powerlink transmission towers, but they attract birds and bats (Donna). What are you doing to address this issue?
27. Have you had any incidents of blades falling off or fires being started? (Patricia) *There are a few isolated incidents of that happening in the industry yes. We have been working with San Diego Rural Fire Authority, SD County Fire, Cal Fire, BLM Fire and Tribal Fire. We signed an agreement with the SD Rural Fire Authority that covers parts of the back country and there is a map in the EIR. But Rural Fire does not cover this area. Boulevard and Jacumba are not*

- staffed 24/7 on a regular basis. They are volunteer departments with some oversight. (community member/ retired fire fighter)
28. What chemical will be used in the fire suppression system in the turbines and is it an automated system? *It is automated.* Who is doing the inspection and how often will that be done? *Whatever that manufacturer tells us needs to be done.* What happens if the system fails if the power goes out? *Alarms will go off and fire depts. will be called out.*
 29. Do you have a fire plan already written up? *We do and it was accepted by the Rural Fire* Where is it available to look at? *It is a public document and I can provide you a copy that is not in the document. I will mail it to the group tomorrow, attention Donna Tisdale. And the Jacumba Sponsor Group.*
 30. How many feet away are the turbines from an archeological site? *100 feet some further and some closer.* Are the tribes going to have a copy of the map of where the turbines are being placed in relation to the sites? *Yes, we are scheduling a meeting with the tribes and BLM on I believe March 1st.* Community tribal member/ Dave stated that Iberdrola is number 5-7 on a long list of projects in line for cultural survey completion.
 31. What are the setback requirements/ Have you gone into negotiations with the county on what they are going to allow for a set back because that will have a major impact on all other projects that are up here? (Chris) *Yes we are discussing now.*
 32. Would this project be economically feasible to Iberdrola with the reduced turbines alternative (65)? (Chris) *Yes, and we can do without federal funding but we accept federal funding so we can pass on that savings to the utility.*
 33. Are you involved in another project in Imperial Valley? *No, that may be Pattern Energy the one SDG&E signed a contract with.*
 34. Have you done studies with big horn sheep in the area and what would be the impact? (community tribal member/ Dave) *Yes, the site does not have the terrain that the sheep prefer. We did not study Ewiiapaayp land. There is no escape route for them. The population is to the east of the site. We evaluated our site and historical data.* Tribal member disputed that , saying their studies are flawed. He has lived here is entire life. Bighorns have historically been in the upper areas of both Ewiiapaayp, McCain Valley, and Black Mountain. Sometimes his father hunted them for food. He stated that another bighorn was recently found near Alpine and several bighorns were reported near I-8 and Kitchen Creek by a Jacumba resident.
 35. Who does the inspections on all turbines? *We hire a third party that inspects them on a rotational pattern.* Is there a county inspector? *I do not know I'm sure there are.*
 36. What about turbine blade washing to keep performance up? (Tammy) *We don't need to do that.*

M/S Jeff/Pat: Submit comments, based on draft list, previous comments, plus whatever else is considered necessary by the February 16th, 2011 deadline with Chris reviewing the letter electronically. 7-0-0

- B. Eco Substation, Tule Wind, Energia Sierra Juarez MUP's:** There is nothing we can do at this time until the county does something with the major use permits so there was no action on this item.

C. Chapman Ranch AT&T Faux Water Tank Cell Site: 41749 Historic Route 80; POD-012:

Proposed 45ft. cell tower 25 ft property line set back 75ft set back from existing residence, 21' 4" by 21' 4" AT&T enclosure, underground power routing. Not on the Chapman ranch and we have asked that they change the name. It is in a scenic area of Old Highway 80.

M/S Cheryl/Jeff Oppose the request for the cell tower based on cumulative project impacts to the area and adjacent neighbors. Ask that it be located back at the original Chapman Ranch site where multiple power lines are planned, using previous rock camouflage. 7-0-0

C. Updates and Potential Action Items:

A. Update on Brucci Met Tower Appeal & The Enel Jewel Valley Met Tower Application:

Patrick Brown from the county informed the Chair that he will move the Brucci met tower to the inactive list. They are not complying and they have not paid required fees. The Enel Jewel Valley met facility applications had to be modified because of the noise emissions and set back. They will come back with some adjusted locations.

B. General Plan Update: The Chair reported on the January 29th steering committee meeting which involved all planning group and sponsor group chairs they. Businesses (like the Hamann Companies, Star Ranch, Lansing etc.) are trying to undercut all the work that has been done by planning groups since 1997. They want it to go back to an old expired community plan. A map was presented with the 6 major property specific referral requests for the area. If we were to open any one of the requests it would open up the proposed general plan and would require another 3-5 years of work and expense to the County. We would have to repeat all the major processes and expenses. Most referral applicants had attended a few of the planning meetings. Two previous requests for smaller lots were approved. One property owner did not follow through.

M/S Chris/Audra: Reject any and all of property specific requests. We do not want to reopen the process after 13 plus years of hard work by the Group and Community. 7-0-0

C. Sunrise Powerlink & Boulevard Community Council:

D. Boulevard Revitalization: We are going to ask for a larger community center. This building is supposed to be 30 capacity at tonight's meeting we had 57 people and they are going to kick us back in the fire station equipment bay with no heat. The fire marshal would have closed us down with this many people in the building. We need chairs and we had 12 roof leaks. CERT classes are free and flyer posted on board, February 28th is the next Fire Safe Meeting at 6:30 at La Posta Reservation. Red Cross grant came through and we will be having 44 new street signs being installed in Jacumba and Boulevard. They will be installed by volunteers. They will be metal pole with green signs like in the city.

7. **Presentation From The Floor:** On Non-Agenda Items: Public Comment. The Planning Group cannot take action on items that are not on the agenda. Public comment or other items may be taken out of order upon request.
8. **Adjournment:** The meeting was adjourned at 10:10 PM. Minutes are submitted by Audra Hall, Secretary. _____

For more information, contact Donna Tisdale, Chair
619-766-4170; P.O. Box 1272, Boulevard, CA 91905; donnatisdale@hughes.net